

USG Core Curriculum Evaluation Committee: Core Curriculum Policy

ROUGH DRAFT of March 23, 2009

NB: This draft combines previously posted material, new material, and cut-and-pastes from existing policy. It is a truly rough.

Material in [] is not part of the policy. It is a question, comment, or example.

Informal Overview

The Committee found a clear desire for two goals that are in tension: ease of transfer and institutional flexibility to develop cores that fit their unique missions. In addition, the current grave economic context means that any changes to the core must not impose any additional costs on institutions.

In light of these factors, the Committee is currently considering the following proposal:

1. The core will remain at its current size, 42 hours in Areas A-E and 18 hours in Area F.
2. The areas A-F will remain but instead of specifying a precise number of hours in all areas specify minima in Areas B, C, D and E as follows:

Area A1: Communications Skills:	6 hours
[Change A1 to “at least 6 hours”?]	
Area A2: Quantitative Skills:	3 hours
Area B: Institutional Options:	At least 3 hours
Area C: Humanities/Fine Arts:	At least 6 hours
Area D: Natural Sciences, Math, and Technology:	At least 7 hours
At least 4 of these hours must be in a natural science lab course.	
Area E: Social Sciences:	At least 6 hours
Area F: Lower-Division Major Requirements:	18 hours
3. Require that, with some exceptions, all core courses must transfer, even if a core area is not completed and even if it means giving transfer credit across areas (e.g., credit for a math course in humanities/fine arts area or vice versa).
4. Add learning goals regarding US Perspectives and Global Perspectives incorporated as overlay requirements. Each institution would designate some courses in Areas A-E as US courses and some courses in Areas A-E as GL courses. As they are fulfilling the Area A-E requirements, every student must take at least one US course and at least one GL course.
5. Add a learning goal regarding Critical Thinking incorporated by requiring each institution to develop a plan to assess critical thinking. [Delay implementation of this item due to economic conditions?]

These proposals would require no significant changes in this time of serious budget problems. On the other hand, institutions would be allowed the flexibility to adapt their cores to their missions.

1 **Formal Policy**

2 [The following rules replace those found in the Academic Affairs Handbook, Sections 2.04.01 to
3 2.04.04.]

4 **General Education Learning Goals**

5 The University System of Georgia is a composite of diverse institutions which, in spite of their
6 diversity, require System-wide coherence to facilitate student success at transferring within the
7 System. To achieve these ends, the System outlines general learning goals that serve as guides
8 for each institution to develop its own learning outcomes. Each institution is required to develop
9 one or more learning outcomes for each learning goal. **Instead of presenting the learning goals
10 with descriptions or specific required outcomes, examples of learning outcomes that would
11 fall under each learning goal are provided.**

12 To insure coherence, the learning outcomes developed by institutions must be approved by the
13 Council on General Education.

14 All institutions must assess their learning outcomes using national best practice methods as
15 applied to their specific circumstances. [Should there be a more detailed explanation here? More
16 about “best practices” and “specific circumstances”?]

17 [As this proposal is developed, the Committee has agreed that if a BOR Academic Advisory
18 Committee officially approves any additional examples of learning outcomes, they will be added
19 to this list below. To submit additional example outcomes, the committee chair should post them
20 to the Topic 1: Learning Outcomes of the Committee’s <http://core.usg.edu/blog/>]

21 ***Learning Goal A1: Communications Skills***

22 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:

- 23 -Students produce well-organized communication that meets conventional standards of
24 correctness, exhibits an appropriate style, and presents substantial material.
- 25 -Students communicate effectively using appropriate writing conventions.
- 26 -Students have the ability to assimilate, analyze, and present in oral and written forms, a body of
27 information.
- 28 -Students have the ability to adapt communication to circumstances and audience.
- 29 -Students have the ability to interpret content of written materials on related topics from various
30 disciplines.
- 31 -Students demonstrate an understanding of what constitutes plagiarism and acknowledge the use
32 of information sources.

33 ***Learning Goal A2: Quantitative Skills***

- 34 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
35 -Students have a strong foundation in mathematical concepts, processes, and structure.
36 -Students effectively apply symbolic representations to model and solve problems.
37 -Students have the ability to model situations from a variety of settings in generalized
38 mathematical forms.
39 -Students have the ability to express and manipulate mathematical information, concepts, and
40 thoughts in verbal, numeric, graphical and symbolic form while solving a variety of
41 problems.
42 -Students have the ability to solve multiple-step problems through different (inductive, deductive
43 and symbolic) modes of reasoning.

44 ***Learning Goal B: Institutional Options***

45 System institutions are encouraged to develop additional learning goals (and their associated
46 outcomes) that fit their respective missions. Examples of possible additional goals include:
47 collaboration, technology, ethics, civic responsibility and/or civic engagement, and service
48 learning.

49 ***Learning Goal C: Humanities/Fine Arts***

- 50 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
51 -Students can compare and contrast the meaning of major texts from both Western and
52 non-Western cultures.
53 -Students recognize themselves as participants in a particular culture and see how this affects
54 their experiences and values.
55 -Students have the ability to make informed judgments about art forms from various cultures
56 including one's own culture.
57 -Students have the ability to recognize the fine arts as expressions of human experience.
58 -Students have the ability to critically appreciate historical and contemporary fine art forms as
59 they relate to individual and social needs and values.
60 -Students have the ability to apply knowledge of historical, social, and cultural influences to
61 understanding a work of art.

62 ***Learning Goal D: Natural Sciences***

- 63 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
64 -Students have the ability to understand the physical universe and science's relationship to it.
65 -Students have the ability to understand the changing nature of science.

66 ***Learning Goal E: Social Sciences***

- 67 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
68 -Students have the ability to describe how historical, economic, political, social, and spatial

- 69 relationships develop, persist, and change.
70 -Students have the ability to articulate the complexity of human behavior as functions of the
71 commonality and diversity within groups.

72 ***Learning Goal I: U.S. Perspectives***

- 73 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
74 -Students understand the history of the U.S. and can see the effect of this history on
75 contemporary culture.
76 -Students understand the importance of cultural diversity in the U.S.
77 -Students understand the constitutional principles and related political, social, and institutional
78 developments and governmental processes fundamental to an understanding of American
79 democracy and political participation, from colonial times to the present.

80 ***Learning Goal II: Global Perspectives***

- 81 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
82 -Students are engaged and informed global citizens, aware of global multicultural issues, and
83 able to explain the differences among personal social, political and economic decision-
84 making processes at the state, federal and international levels of government.
85 -Students effectively explore the place of the U.S. in the diverse realm of societies across the
86 globe.
87 -Students have communicative competence in a second language.
88 -Students recognize individual and cultural differences across the globe and demonstrate an
89 ability to communicate and interact effectively across cultures.

90 ***Learning Goal III: Critical Thinking***

- 91 Examples of learning outcomes that would forward this goal:
92 -Students are active, independent, and self-directed thinkers and learners that apply their thinking
93 skills and innovation to solve problems.
94 -Students confront ambiguous situations and go beyond traditional approaches to devise more
95 useful and favorable solutions.
96 -Students effectively identify, analyze, evaluate and provide convincing reasons in support of
97 conclusions.
98 -Students have the ability to consider and accommodate opposing points of view.
99 -Students have the ability to interpret inferences and develop subtleties of symbolic and indirect
100 discourse.
101 -Students have the ability to recognize when information is needed and have the ability to locate,
102 evaluate, and use effectively the needed information.
103 -Students have the ability to identify the audience, intent, value, and disciplinary perspective of
104 potential sources of information.

105 **Areas A-F**

106 Every institution in the USG will have a core curriculum of precisely 42 semester hours as
107 follows:

108	Area A1	Communication Skills	6 hours
109	Courses that address the skill of writing in English.		
110	Area A2	Quantitative Skills	3 hours
111	Courses that address the skill of quantitative reasoning.		
112	Area B	Institutional Options	At least 3 hours
113	Courses that address general education learning outcomes of the		
114	institution's choosing.		
115	Area C	Humanities/Fine Arts	At least 6 hours
116	Courses that address humanities/fine arts learning outcomes.		
117	Area D	Natural Science, Mathematics, and Technology	At least 7 hours
118	Courses that address learning outcomes in the sciences,		At least 4 of these
119	mathematics, and technology.		hours must be in a
120			lab science course.
121			
122	Area E	Social Sciences	At least 6 hours
123	Courses that address learning outcomes in the social sciences.		
124	Area F	Lower-Division Major Requirements	18 hours
125	Lower division courses related to the degree program and		
126	courses that are prerequisites to major courses at higher levels.		

127 **Areas US, GL and CT**

128 Each institution's Areas A-E will include three additional requirements as follows:

129	Area US	US Perspectives
130	Courses that focus on the United States of America.	
131	Area GL	Global Perspectives
132	Courses that focus on countries other than the United States of America.	

133 Each institution will designate one or more courses in Areas A-E as US courses and one or more
134 courses in Areas A-E as GL courses. No course may be both a US course and a GL course. As

135 they are fulfilling the Area A-E requirements, every student must take at least one US course and
136 at least one GL course.

137 [An example: Phil 1234, Introduction to Western and Non-Western Philosophy is in Area C of
138 the core at Decatur State University. It is designated a GL course. A student who takes Phil
139 1234 would satisfy the GL requirement and also earn hours toward the Area C requirement.]

140 Area CT Critical Thinking

141 Each institution must have a core curriculum CT plan to insure that students who complete Areas
142 A-E acquire foundational critical thinking skills. Institutions are encouraged to be innovative in
143 their CT plans. Options include but are not limited to:

144 -designating a course or courses in Areas A-E as CT courses and requiring that as they are
145 fulfilling the Area A-E requirements every student must take at least one CT
146 course.

147 -requiring students to develop a CT portfolio composed of materials from assignments in
148 Area A-E courses. This portfolio would then be evaluated by designated faculty.

149 -requiring that students earn a particular score on a nationally recognized critical thinking
150 test (e.g., the California Critical Thinking Skills Test, the Analytical Writing
151 Section of the GRE General Test, the SAT Writing test).

152 **Details Regarding Each Area**

153 All courses in Areas A-E must be taught at the collegiate level and be broadly focused. They
154 must clearly address general education outcomes for the institution. They should also show
155 consistency with the institutional mission statement and with the System's core curriculum,
156 principles, vision, and guiding principles. The Areas A-E must include introductory courses.
157 (See line 230.)

158 *Area A1 Communication Skills*

159 Engl 1101 and Engl 1102 must be placed in this area. Other approved courses may also be
160 placed in this area. (See below for course approval rules.)

161 *Area A2 Quantitative Skills*

162 [The Committee's intent is to preserve the current rules regarding Areas A2 and D for STEM
163 majors. These rules are complex. The Committee invites faculty and staff from across the
164 system to check our work to verify that all the current rules are here. If any are missing, please
165 send a note to grainbolt@gsu.edu.]

166 For students majoring in mathematics, physics, chemistry, biology, engineering technology,
167 architecture, computer science, geology, geography (B.S.), forestry, pharmacy, physical therapy,
168 secondary science, or mathematics education, pre-calculus will be the required mathematics

169 course in Area A2 at all institutions. In this document, these majors are collectively referred to as
170 “science” majors.

171 Institutions may require pre-calculus in Area A2 for majors in agricultural science and
172 environmental science.

173 Calculus is required in Area A2 for all engineering majors and for all programs at Georgia
174 Institute of Technology.

175 At institutions where trigonometry serves as an immediate prerequisite for Calculus I, then the
176 completion of trigonometry will be regarded as completion of pre-calculus in Area A2.
177 Institutions do not need Council on General Education approval to add such trigonometry courses
178 to Area A2, but the course catalog and the institution’s listing of Area A2 courses on the core
179 curriculum website (http://www.usg.edu/academics/programs/core_curriculum/a-e.html) should
180 indicate that the trigonometry course in Area A2 meets the pre-calculus requirement.

181 The following courses may not be used as substitutions for algebra or mathematical modeling in
182 Area A2: symbolic logic, elementary statistics, and math for liberal arts.

183 [Do we want to leave these A2 rules in place? Perhaps delete “symbolic logic” from the list
184 above and replace it with. “Symbolic logic may be used as substitution for algebra or
185 mathematical modeling but only if it includes coverage of propositional logic.” Perhaps allow an
186 sufficiently rigorous stats course to count. There were suggestions on the blog that a personal
187 finance course be allowed here.]

188 Institutions or programs may grant one semester hour of credit for an Area A2 course to count in
189 Area F or in the general degree requirements.

190 ***Area B Institutional Options***

191 Courses in Area B must include analytical, historical, critical and/or appreciative realms.

192 Wellness courses are allowed in Area B and may contain some basic health and physical
193 education components provided that these are not the primary focus.

194 [Is allowing wellness in Area B consistent with the requirement that all Area A-F courses be at
195 the collegiate level?]

196 ***Area C Humanities/Fine Arts***

197 Courses in Area C must include analytical, historical, critical and/or appreciative realms.

198 Speech courses may be included in Area C if they include analytical, historical, critical and/or
199 appreciative components.

200 ***Area D Natural Science, Mathematics, and Technology***

201 “Science” programs may specify a higher level math course in Area D.

202 No “science” program may require that students take a particular science in Area D. [For
203 example, chemistry may not require that chemistry majors complete Area D with chemistry
204 courses.]

205 Creative writing and technical communication courses may not be included in Area D. These
206 courses should be introductory and broadly focused.

207 Institutions or programs may grant one semester hour of credit for an Area D course to count in
208 Area F or in the general degree requirements.

209 Institutions may have Area D requirements specific to “science” programs.

210 Students in the health professions, including nursing, must fulfill the Area D science requirement
211 with a two-semester laboratory sequence in either physics, chemistry, or biology. The only
212 biology courses that may be used to fulfill this requirement are Introductory Biology (designed
213 for non-science majors) and Principles of Biology (designed for science majors). The Survey of
214 Chemistry sequence (Chem 1151 and Chem 1152) has been designed for the Area D health
215 professions track. Health professions majors have the option of taking the Survey of Chemistry
216 sequence or the sequence appropriate for science majors, but they may not fulfill their Area D
217 requirements with chemistry courses designed for non-science majors.

218 Non-science majors may use the Survey of Chemistry sequence to fulfill the Area D
219 requirements, but it may not be used to fulfill the science requirements for “science” majors not
220 in the health professions.

221 ***Area E Social Sciences***

222 Courses in Area E must include analytical, historical, critical and/or appreciative realms.

223

224 If course work is used to satisfy the U.S./Georgia history and constitutions requirement, these
225 course(s) will be part of Area E.

226 ***Area F Lower-Division Major Requirements***

227

228 This area must be composed exclusively of 1000/2000 level courses. These courses may be
229 prerequisites for other Area F courses and/or for major courses at higher levels.

230 **Additional Rules**

231 ***Rules Regarding Inclusion in Areas A-F***

232 Every institution must offer a path to completing all Area A-E requirements composed of 1000
233 and 2000 level courses. Other approved 3000 and 4000 level courses may also be placed in Areas
234 A-E. (See below for course approval rules.)

235 Physical education activity/basic health requirements may not be placed in Areas A-F. One
236 physical education activity/basic health course may be required outside of Areas A-F in excess of
237 the maximum number of hours indicated for undergraduate degrees. Offerings in physical
238 education/health in excess of the maximum number of hours indicated for undergraduate degrees
239 will be limited to activity, basic health information, first aid, CPR, and safety courses.
240 Transferring students taking physical education/basic health hours at one institution may not be
241 required to duplicate these hours at the receiving institution.

242 Orientation courses may not be placed in Areas A-F. One orientation course may be required
243 outside of Areas A-F in excess of the maximum number of hours indicated for undergraduate
244 degrees. Transferring students taking an orientation course at one institution may be required to
245 take an additional orientation course (outside the maximum hours indicated for the undergraduate
246 degree) at the receiving institution.

247 Courses with a primary emphasis on studio, performance, field study, or internship, or which are
248 otherwise applied in nature may not be placed in Areas A-F.

249 Institutions may decide that the first course in a foreign language falls outside of the maximum
250 number of hours indicated for undergraduate degrees and/or outside of Areas A-F.
251 [The Committee marked this issue for further discussion. The wording in current policy is: "If a
252 student starts at the first elementary course level, an institution or major has the option of
253 whether to include the course within the appropriate hour limitation."]

254 Courses in Areas A-F may not carry a fraction of a semester hour of credit.

255 Institutions may not permit the completion of any course to fulfill requirements in more than one
256 area A-F for any student. Where the same course is authorized in more than area A-F, the student
257 completing the course to meet the requirements of one area must take another course in the
258 second core area to meet the requirements of the second area.

259 According to the Learning Support Administrative Procedures, students exiting Learning Support
260 need to be prepared for the institution's first core curriculum course in an area. Thus, a student
261 exiting Learning Support mathematics must be prepared to take College Algebra or Introduction
262 to Mathematical Modeling. A student exiting Learning Support does not need to be prepared to
263 take pre-calculus even if this is the first core curriculum course that counts in the student's major.

264 ***Approval Procedures***

265 The courses contained in areas A-E and the US and GL designation of courses must be approved
266 first by the relevant Academic Advisory Committee and then by the Council on General
267 Education. CT plans must be approved by the Council on General Education.

268 The courses in Area F must be approved by the relevant Academic Advisory Committee.

269 Courses previously approved do not require re-approval.

270 [There are a few disciplines, e.g., Religious Studies, that do not currently have Academic
271 Advisory Committees. These additional Advisory Committees would need to be created. Every
272 course used in Areas A-F anywhere in the System would need to be assigned to an Advisory
273 Committee.]

274 *Prerequisites*

275 Except as noted elsewhere in this policy, no course in Area A-E may be a prerequisite for any
276 course outside Areas A-E. Except as noted elsewhere in this policy, no course in one area (A-E)
277 may be a prerequisite for any course in any other area (A-E). Courses in one area (A-E) may be
278 prerequisites for other courses in that area.

279 “Science” and health professions majors may require courses in Areas A2 and D as prerequisites
280 for courses in Area F.

281 Institutions may apply to for permission to specify that students in one or more of their degree
282 programs are required to take particular courses within Areas A-E. Institutions may apply for up
283 to 9 hours of such requirements. If permission is granted, these courses may be prerequisites for
284 courses in Area F or in the major’s degree requirements.

285 Applications will be considered first by the relevant Academic Advisory Committees (the
286 advisory committee for the degree program and the advisory committee for course), then by the
287 Administrative Committee on Academic Affairs (RACAA), then by the Council on General
288 Education (Gen Ed Council). The Gen Ed Council will make a recommendation to the System’s
289 Chief Academic Officer.

290 Applications will be considered only if requiring particular courses in Areas A-E will allow the
291 degree program to reduce the number of hours required for the degree.

292 In evaluating such requests RACAA and the Gen Ed Council will consider the following criteria:
293 1. the degree program is in an area in which demand for graduates in Georgia significantly
294 outstrips the supply,
295 2. the degree program requires a special admission process beyond that required for admission to
296 the institution,
297 3. the degree program has a national accreditation body that requires so many hours it is

298 difficult/impossible to design a degree program that is 120 hours without requiring
299 particular courses in Areas A-E, and
300 4. graduates of the degree program must pass a certification or licensure exam before they can
301 exercise the relevant profession.

302 The courses required in Areas A-E may not be taught by the degree program that seeks to require
303 them.

304 The courses required in Areas A-E must be available to and count in Areas A-E for all students,
305 not just those in the degree program.

306 ***Change of Major***

307 Students switching from a non-“science”/health professions major to a “science”/health
308 professions major must meet the Area A2 and Area D requirements for the relevant
309 “science”/health professions major even if they have already completed the Area A2 and Area D
310 requirements for non-“science”/non-health professions majors.

311 ***Transfer Rules***

312 In general, students successfully completing a course in one institution’s Areas A-E will receive
313 full credit in Areas A-E for the course upon transfer to another System institution. However,
314 there are some exceptions.

315 Students successfully completing a course in one institution’s Area F will receive full credit for
316 the course upon transfer to another System institution as long as the student retains the same
317 major.

318 Students must meet the System-specified minimum number of hours in Areas B, C, D, and E.
319 This may result in a student failing to receive transfer credit for an Area B-E course if a transfer
320 student failed to take the System-specified minimum of hours in a particular Area.

321 Students who transfer after having completed the US/GL/ CT requirements of the sending
322 institution may not be required to complete the US/GL/CT requirements of the receiving
323 institutions. Students who transfer after having completed Areas A-E but without having
324 completed the US/GL requirements must take the missing US/GL course at the receiving
325 institution. Students who transfer before completing the sending institution’s CT requirements
326 must complete the receiving institution’s CT requirements.

327 Because the size of individual Areas will vary between institutions, it is possible that students
328 transferring will have excess credits in some areas and lack credits in others.

329 Credits will be transferred in the order they were successfully completed. Courses taken in the

330 same semester transfer alphabetically by prefix and then by course number.

331 Excess courses will transfer as follows:

332 [The Committee needs to discuss this paragraph. It is considering using Area B as a catch-all
333 area.]

334	Area at	Area at
335	Sending	Receiving
336	Institution	Institution

337	B	B, then see below
338	C	C, then E, then D, then B
339	D	D, then E, then C, then B
340	E	E, then C, then D, then B

341 [Example: Winder State University and Decatur State University have the same number of hours
342 in each Area A-E except that Winder State requires 9 hours in Area C and 8 hours in Area D
343 while Decatur State requires 6 hours in Area C and 11 hours in Area D. Linda completes the
344 core at Winder State and transfers to Decatur State.

345 Q: Which two of the three Area C courses the student took at Winder State would go into
346 Decatur State's Area C?

347 A: The first two Linda completed. If all three Area C courses were taken in the same semester,
348 the first two in alphabetical order by prefix would go into Decatur State's Area C. If Linda took
349 all three Area C courses in the same semester and had the same prefix, the first two in course
350 number order would go into Area C at Decatur State.

351 Because Linda completed 42 hours at Winder State, she has 3 excess hours in Decatur State's
352 Area C and lacks three hours in Decatur State's Area D. Decatur State would count the 3 excess
353 hours in Area D.]

354 For each course in Area B, the sending institution will propose to the relevant Academic
355 Advisory Committee and then to Council on General Education a transfer credit plan that
356 indicates the order in which credit should be accepted.

357 [Example: Spch 1234, Public Speaking, is a course in Area B of the core at Decatur State
358 University. Decatur State might propose transfer as follows: B, then C, then E, then D. They
359 would make this proposal to the Communications Academic Advisory Committee and then to the
360 Gen Ed Council. Once approved, all System institutions would follow this transfer credit pattern
361 for Spch 1234.]

362 [Another option is to specify a transfer pattern for Area B courses. For example,
363 B, then E, then C, then D.]

364 For students who transfer after completing Areas A-F at a System institution, receiving

365 institutions may require that these students complete the requirements as specified for native
366 students; however, the total number of hours required of the transfer student for the baccalaureate
367 degree will not exceed the number of hours required of native students for the same major field.
368 [Remove this paragraph? It confuses people. It makes one think that core courses would have to
369 substitute for upper level courses in a major in order to stay within the hours allowed for a
370 bachelor's degree.]

371 Students in the USG must declare one home institution at a time. Students who transfer from one
372 institution to another automatically change their designated home institution.

373 Students who wish to take courses (including distance learning courses) from a USG institution
374 other than the home institution, either concurrently or intermittently, must receive transient
375 permission to take and receive credit for Areas A-F courses satisfying home institution Area A-F
376 requirements.

377 Students will generally be given permission to take a course with a common System name and
378 number if the course is included in the home institution's Area A-F and the student meets the
379 course prerequisites at both institutions. These courses will meet established requirements of
380 Areas A-F at the home institution.
381 [Remove this rule? It causes problems in cases where one city has institutions of different types,
382 e.g., two-year and regional universities. It may be that several institutions are not following this
383 rule.]

384 Provided that native and transfer students are treated equally, institutions may impose additional
385 reasonable expectations, such as a grade of "C" in Area A-F courses.

386 Each institution will designate a Chief Transfer Officer (CTO) to facilitate the transfer of
387 students within the System. The CTO must have senior administrative and/or faculty status. The
388 CTO is the contact person for students, faculty, advisors, records and admissions personnel, and
389 academic administrators when problems related to transfer of Area A-F course work across
390 System institutions occur. However, CTO's should also be proactive and work to develop
391 institutional procedures that minimize transfer problems. Students with questions or concerns
392 about the transfer of credit between System institutions should contact the CTO at the receiving
393 institution.

394 ***Periodic Review of this Policy***

395 [Add a rule that requires that the System core be reviewed every 5? 7? 10? years? If so, specify a
396 process for this review?]